TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL - PAKISTAN

Plot 72-F/2, 1st Floor, 9th Street, Jami Commercial,
Phase VII, Defence Housing Authority, Karachi
Phone: +92-21-35311898, 35311777
Fax: +92-21-35390410
Email: ti.pakistan@transparency.org.pk
Website: www.transparency.org.pk

October 21, 2026

TL2026/1021/1A

Rear Admiral (R) Syed Moazzam Ilyas HI(M)
Chairman
Port Qasim Authority (PQA)
Karachi

Subject: Complaint Against Serious Allegations of Procedural Irregularities and Violation of PPRA Rules by Port Qasim Authority (PQA) in the Tender for Cleaning & Sweeping Services Contract in PQA Areas, Office & Housing Complex

Dear Sir,

Transparency International Pakistan has received multiple complaints against serious allegations of procedural irregularities and violation of PPRA Rules 2004 by Port Qasim Authority (PQA) in the tender for cleaning and sweeping services in PQA areas, office and housing complex **(Annex-A)**.

The complainants have made the following allegations:

1. The Port Qasim Authority (PQA) invited Tender for Cleaning & Sweeping Services in PQA Areas / Offices & Housing Complex, dated July 23, 2026 and bids opened on September 24, 2026.
2. The pre-bid meeting was held on September 04, 2026, and critical flaws in the tender documents were identified by the bidders. However, PQA failed to address the same before the opening of the bids.
3. The bidders submitted bid via EPADs within the deadline. However, the system failed to reflect vital BOQs specified in the tender document, such as BOQ-D, which is a mandatory requirement. Furthermore, the e-portal included misalignment of the Bill of Quantities (BOQ), missing or unclear line items and automated calculation errors. For instance, the tender documents specified a 30-day period, whereas the E-PAD was configured to calculate values based on 15 days, creating an inconsistency that affected the accuracy of financial bids.
4. M/s Marhaba Traders and Allied Services submitted grievance to the PQA GRC, followed by a formal reminder. To date, PQA has not taken any action and has failed to provide any formal response in clear violation of PPRA Rules 2004.
5. PQA published Technical Evaluation Report on the e-pad, declaring both bidders technically disqualified without providing any valid justification. Concurrently, PQA also announced the opening of financial bids on October 22, 2026 **(Annex-B)**.

Transparency International Pakistan Comments

Transparency International Pakistan has reviewed the allegations of the complaint. Prima facie, the allegations seem correct.

Following are TI Pakistan's comments and recommendations.

1. As per the PPRA Rules 2004, every procuring agency must ensure that the procurement process is conducted in a fair and transparent manner, and that the bidding process contributes value for money. The Rule is quoted below for your reference;

> ***PPRA Rule 4. Principles of procurements.-*** *Procuring agencies, while engaging in procurements, shall ensure that the procurements are conducted in a fair and transparent manner, the object of procurement brings value for money to the agency and the procurement process is efficient and economical*

1. The PPRA Rule 65 (2) mandates that any complaint by the bidder against the terms and conditions described in the bidding documents will be addressed by the GRC and must be decided within 10 days, the rule is quoted below

> ***PPRA Rule 65 - Redressal of grievances (2):*** *Any party may file a written complaint, two days prior to the proposal submission deadline, against the eligibility parameters, evaluation criteria or any other terms and conditions described in the bidding documents, if found contrary to the provisions of the procurement regulatory framework, and the same shall be addressed by the GRC.*

2. The alleged discrepancies in the BOQ can clearly affect the competitiveness of the bidding process and compromise transparency and it is imperative that the PQA addresses the complaints filed by bidders as per PPRA Rule 65 (2).

Transparency International Pakistan Recommendations

Transparency International Pakistan requests the Chairman PQA to look into the allegations of the complaint, and if found correct, issue directives to re-invite tender in compliance with PPRA Rules 2004, Public Procurement Rules 2026, to avoid mis-procurement under PPRA Rule 67.

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for across-the-board application of Rule of Law, which is the only way to stop corruption, and achieve Zero tolerance against corruption.

Regards,

Advocate Daniyal Muzaffar,
Trustee/Legal Advisor
Transparency International Pakistan

Copies forwarded for the information with request to take action under their mandate to:

1. Advisor to Prime Minister, PM House, Islamabad
2. Federal Minister, Ministry of Maritime Affairs, Islamabad.
3. Federal Secretary, Ministry of Maritime Affairs, Islamabad
4. Managing Director PPRA Islamabad.
5. Chairman, Prime Minister Inspection Commission (PMIC), Islamabad.
6. Registrar, Supreme Court of Pakistan, Islamabad.

Note:
This is to clarify that Transparency International Pakistan is not a complainant, it acts as a whistleblower and operate under Article 19-A, of the Constitution of Pakistan which gives the right to public to know how government is being run by public officers. Article 19-A makes the right to access of information pertaining to a public authority a fundamental right, and a three-member bench in case of Mukhtar Ahmad Ali vs the Registrar, Supreme Court of Pakistan, Islamabad, headed by Chief Justice Qazi Faez Isa in the landmark judgment on 16 October 2023, in CP No. 3532/2023, has declared that

> "What previously may have been on a need-to-know basis Article 19A of the Constitution has transformed it to a right-to-know, and the Access to information is no longer a discretion granted through occasional benevolence, but is now a fundamental right available with every Pakistani which right may be invoked under Article 19A of the Constitution"

Annex- A-1

Allied Services
your's maintenance prople

Suite # 6, Ground Floor, Goldline Residency, Block 16A, KDA Scheme 36, Gulistan e Johar, Mobile 03453351144

To,
The GRC-PQA-Karachi

Dated: 23.09.2026

Tender For Cleaning & Sweeping Services Uploaded on E-Pad for PQA

It is submitted that PQA uploaded Minutes of the Meeting (Cleaning & Sweeping Tender) on 15.09.2026 and observed that our queries has not been properly addressed regarding roads dimensions, polishing area and jungle cutting work. *"Despite a thorough review of the tender document, the specific dimensions and surface areas for the roads, jungle cutting area and polishing scope remain unspecified; Due to technical issues on the E-pad portal – specifically the absence of the BOQ sheets and incorrect automated calculations – we faced difficulties during bid entry. We kindly request the department to fix and update the tender document, and then reissue it."*

Thanking you for your co-operation.

Yours faithfully,

Fort Allied Services



Allied Services

Authorizes representative
Name: IFTIKHAR ZAFAR
Designation: Chief Executive
Contact: 0345 335 111 44

Allied Services

your's maintenance prople

Suite # 6, Ground Floor, Goldline Residency, Block 16A, KDA Scheme 36, Gulistan e Johar, Mobile 03453351144

To,

Dated: 01st October, 2026

The GRC-DG (Ops), PQA-Karachi
The DG (Administration), PQA-Karachi
The Director (Finance)/Member-GRC, PQA-Karachi
The Director (Ops Maint)/Member-GRC, PQA-Karachi

Subject: Urgent Reminder: Request for Reissuance of Updated Tender Document

Dear Sir,

With reference to the Minutes of the Meeting published on September 15, 2026, and our subsequent query letter dated September 23, 2026, we kindly request a status update regarding the subject tender.

As mentioned earlier, key details such as the exact dimensions for the roads, polishing areas, and jungle cutting work are still missing. Additionally, technical errors on the E-PAD portal—including missing Bill of Quantities (BOQ) sheets and incorrect calculations—are preventing us from entering our bid accurately.

We highly appreciate your prompt attention to this matter and thank you for your valuable cooperation.

Yours faithfully,

For Allied Services



Allied Services

IFTIKHAR ZAFAR
Chief Executive
Authorizes representative
Name: IFTIKHAR ZAFAR
Designation: Chief Executive
Contact: 0345 335 111 44

Annex-A-2

MARHABA TRADERS

Civil Maintenance, Transport Services, Aircraft Ground, Support Vehicles, Janitorial Services, Manpower Provider, Catering Services.

REMINDER LETTER
Dated: 05.09.2026

Request for Immediate Decision on Grievance under Rule-48 of PPRA, 2004 and Re-Invitation of Tender after Modification of Technical Irregularities

Reference: Our grievance letter dated 22nd September, 2026 on the tender for Cleaning & Sweeping Services in PQA Areas/Offices & Housing Complex

Honourable Sir,

With reference to the subject grievance submitted before the Grievance Redressal Committee, it is respectfully submitted that the serious technical irregularities and inconsistencies already pointed out in our earlier complaint have not been satisfactorily resolved/communicated to us.

2. As highlighted in our earlier representation, the e-procurement portal contains material discrepancies, including BOQ misalignment, missing/unclear line items, automated calculation errors, and a fundamental discrepancy between the 30-day period prescribed in the tender documents and the 15-day period being reflected/configured in the system. These issues directly affect the preparation, calculation and submission of a correct and compliant financial bid.

3. The matter is therefore not merely a minor technical issue. The discrepancies have the potential to affect the accuracy, transparency, equal opportunity and competitiveness of the bidding process, as bidders cannot reasonably be expected to submit a reliable financial offer where the electronic BOQ and calculation mechanism do not correspond with the actual tender requirements.

4. It is pertinent to mention that Rule-48(2) of the Public Procurement Rules, 2004 provides a mechanism for a party to lodge a written complaint against eligibility parameters, evaluation criteria or other terms and conditions of bidding documents where such provisions are found contrary to the applicable procurement regulatory framework. Further, Rule-48(6) provides that the Grievance Redressal Committee shall investigate and decide upon the complaint within the prescribed period.

5. In view of the above, and in continuation of our earlier grievance, it is once again requested that the Grievance Redressal Committee may kindly:

1. Take up and decide our grievance formally under Rule-48 of the Public Procurement Rules, 2004, after examining all the technical and procedural irregularities highlighted in our complaint.
2. Direct suspension/closure of the ongoing tender proceedings, where legally applicable, until the identified discrepancies are fully examined and resolved, so that no bidder is placed at an unfair advantage or disadvantage due to the defective electronic bidding mechanism.

Head Office: Room No. 05 & 06, 1st Floor, A.L.C. Building, Export Cargo Complex, Jinnah International Air Port, Karachi. Ph: 021-34682222 Cell: 0300-9229683, 0300-2664207
Web: marhabatraders.webs.com E-mail: marhabatradersi@hotmail.com

CamScanner

MARHABA TRADERS

Civil Maintenance, Transport Services, Aircraft Ground, Support Vehicles, Janitorial Services, Manpower Provider, Catering Services.

3. Cancel/withdraw the present tender and re-invite the tender after rectification of all technical, BOQ and calculation-related discrepancies, particularly the discrepancy between the required 30-day billing/quotation period and the 15-day configuration appearing on the e-procurement portal.
4. Before re-invitation, ensure that the BOQs are completely aligned with the tender documents, all required line items and descriptions are correctly incorporated, and the computerised calculation mechanism is properly configured and tested.
5. Provide a corrected/revised BOQ and bidding template, ensuring that all bidders are able to quote their rates on an equal and technically accurate basis.
6. Allow a reasonable and appropriate period for submission of bids after re-invitation, so that all prospective bidders have equal opportunity to participate in a transparent and competitive procurement process.
7. Communicate the decision of the Grievance Redressal Committee in writing, along with the action taken on the specific anomalies and objections raised in our earlier complaint.

8. It is further requested that the matter may kindly be treated as URGENT, as continuation of the procurement process despite unresolved technical discrepancies may adversely affect the integrity of the bidding process and may result in avoidable disputes at a later stage.

9. We therefore sincerely request to the Grievance Redressal Committee to take appropriate action strictly in accordance with Rule-48 of the PPRA Rules, 2004, decide the grievance at the earliest, and re-invite the tender after making all necessary corrections and modifications.

Yours faithfully,

(Asif Ali)
Managing Partner
0300-2664207

Forwarded to:

GRC HEAD - Director General Operations
GRC MEMBER- Director Operation Maintenance
GRC MEMBER- Director Finance

07/10/25

DIRECTOR OFFICE RECEIVED Date 7/10/25

DEPARTMENT * OPERATION * MAINTENANCE * DEPARTMENT

Head Office: Room No. 05 & 06, 1st Floor, A.L.C. Building, Export Cargo Complex, Jinnah International Air Port, Karachi. Ph: 021-34682222 Cell: 0300-9229683, 0300-2664207
Web: marhabatraders.webs.com E-mail: marhabatradersl@hotmail.com

Pak. Sustm Authority Dy. No. 7-10-25 O/W D.G. (Ops. gectt.)

CamScanner

Annex-B

Technical Evaluation Report

(Under Rule 35 of Public Procurement Rules, 2004)

Procuring Agency Name	Port Qasim Authority
Procurement Title	CLEANING & SWEEPING SERVICES CONTRACT FOR PQA AREAS / OFFICES & HOUSING COMPLEX 2026-28
Procurement Reference Number	P96877
Procurement Type	Non-Consultancy Services
Procurement Procedure	Single Stage-Two Envelope
Evaluation Criteria	Least Cost Based Selection (LCBS)
Date & Time (Bid Closing)	Thursday, September 24, 2026 11:30 AM
Date & Time (Bid Opening)	Thursday, September 24, 2026 12:00 PM
No. of Bids Received	20
Report Preparation Date	Wednesday, October 14, 2026 06:53 PM
Report Publish Date	Wednesday, October 14, 2026 07:16 PM

BIDDER NAME	ELIGIBILITY	TECHNICAL MARKS: 100 PASSING: 60	REMARKS UNDER 35(2) OF PUBLIC PROCUREMENT RULES, 2004
M. M. Associates (Pvt.) Ltd. Company (Private Limited)	Eligible	93 Weightage : ((93 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 93)	
Best Mansol Services (Pvt) Ltd Company (Private Limited)	Ineligible	--	Declared ineligible by the majority of Procurement Committee members.

BIDDER NAME	ELIGIBILITY	TECHNICAL MARKS: 100 PASSING: 60	REMARKS UNDER 35(2) OF PUBLIC PROCUREMENT RULES, 2004
New Ghulam mustafa and Brothers Sole Proprietorship	Eligible	0 Weightage : ((0 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 0)	Technically Disqualified for failing to achieve the minimum passing score of 60.
HRSG SSP (Private) Limited Company (Private Limited)	Eligible	50.4 Weightage : ((50.4 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 50.4)	Technically Disqualified for failing to achieve the minimum passing score of 60.
Mr. Shamsullah & Sons Individual / Individual Consultant	Eligible	92 Weightage : ((92 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 92)	
Cleanbuster Partnership Firm	Eligible	91.2 Weightage : ((91.2 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 91.2)	
Power Supplies Company (Private) Limited Company (Private Limited)	Eligible	61.8 Weightage : ((61.8 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 61.8)	
MOMI ASSOCIATES (SMC) PVT LTD Company (Private Limited)	Eligible	91 Weightage : ((91 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 91)	
international cleaning services Sole Proprietorship	Eligible	64 Weightage : ((64 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 64)	
Nasir Mehmood & Co. Sole Proprietorship	Eligible	90 Weightage : ((90 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 90)	
Kolachi Trader (Private) Limited Company (Private Limited)	Eligible	91 Weightage : ((91 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 91)	
Elite Services Sole Proprietorship	Eligible	96 Weightage : ((96 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 96)	
BB Associates Sole Proprietorship	Eligible	61 Weightage : ((61 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 61)	
Talha & Zeeshan Engineering Company Sole Proprietorship	Eligible	43 Weightage : ((43 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 43)	Technically Disqualified for failing to achieve the minimum passing score of 60.

BIDDER NAME	ELIGIBILITY	TECHNICAL MARKS: 100 PASSING: 60	REMARKS UNDER 35(2) OF PUBLIC PROCUREMENT RULES, 2004
CERES WASTE MANAGEMENT PVT LTD Company (Private Limited)	Eligible	80 Weightage : ((80 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 80)	
New Grace Enterprises Sole Proprietorship	Eligible	92 Weightage : ((92 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 92)	
NEW PARADISE Sole Proprietorship	Eligible	91.2 Weightage : ((91.2 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 91.2)	
M/s. Allied Services Sole Proprietorship	Eligible	55 Weightage : ((55 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 55)	Technically Disqualified for failing to achieve the minimum passing score of 60.
Marhana Traders Partnership Firm	Eligible	42 Weightage : ((42 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 42)	Technically Disqualified for failing to achieve the minimum passing score of 60.
Mr. Shahid Iqbal Individual / Individual Consultant	Eligible	0 Weightage : ((0 / 100 x 100) x 100% = 0)	Technically Disqualified for failing to achieve the minimum passing score of 60.

Positions and Lots

CLEANING & SWEEPING SERVICES CONTRACT FOR PQA AREAS / OFFICES & HOUSING COMPLEX 2026-28 *(INDIVIDUAL POSITION/SERVICE)*	REMARKS UNDER 35(2) OF PUBLIC PROCUREMENT RULES, 2004
international cleaning services Sole Proprietorship	Qualified
NEW PARADISE Sole Proprietorship	Qualified
BB Associates Sole Proprietorship	Qualified
Power Supplies Company (Private) Limited Company (Private Limited)	Qualified
Cleanbuster Partnership Firm	Qualified
M. M. Associates (Pvt.) Ltd. Company (Private Limited)	Qualified
CERES WASTE MANAGEMENT PVT LTD Company (Private Limited)	Qualified

CLEANING & SWEEPING SERVICES CONTRACT FOR PQA AREAS / OFFICES & HOUSING COMPLEX 2026-28 *(INDIVIDUAL POSITION/SERVICE)*	REMARKS UNDER 35(2) OF PUBLIC PROCUREMENT RULES, 2004
MOMI ASSOCIATES (SMC) PVT LTD Company (Private Limited)	Qualified
Elite Services Sole Proprietorship	Qualified
New Grace Enterprises Sole Proprietorship	Qualified
Nasir Mehmood & Co. Sole Proprietorship	Qualified
Kolachi Trader (Private) Limited Company (Private Limited)	Qualified
Mr. Shamsullah & Sons Individual / Individual Consultant	Qualified

PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATORY AUTHORITY (PPRA) EPADS