

Plot 72-F/2, 1st Floor, 9th Street, Jami Commercial, Phase VII, Defence Housing Authority, Karachi

Phone: +92-21-35390408, 35311898

Fax: +92-21-35390410 Email: ti.pakistan@gmail.com Website: www.transparency.org.pk

13th September, 2023

TL2023/0913/1A

Barrister Murtaza Wahab, Mayor Karachi Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) Karachi.

Sub: Complaint on the Allegations of Violation of SPPRA Rules 2010 in Request for Proposal (RFP) Selection of Consultants for Planning and Design and Construction Supervision of Roads, Bridges, Flyovers, Underpasses, Storm Water Drainage System, Buildings for Various Projects in Mega City of Karachi

Dear Sir,

Transparency International Pakistan has received a complaint on the allegations of violation of SPPRA Rules 2010 in the Selection of Consultants for Planning and Design and Construction Supervision of Roads, Bridges, Flyovers, Underpasses, Storm Water Drainage System, Buildings for Various Projects in Mega City of Karachi.

The complainant has made the following allegations:

That;

- Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) Engineering Department has issued Request for Proposal (RFP) for Consultancy Services for Planning and Design and Construction Supervision of Roads, Bridges, Flyovers, Underpasses, Storm Water Drainage System, Buildings etc. of various Projects and execute Umbrella Contract Agreement, on 2nd August 2023 (Annex-A).
- 2. On 29th August 2023, KMC vide its notification No. Dir(Actt.)Engg:Deptt/KMC/116/2023 issued a corrigendum "Notice of extension of date of submission of RFP" (Annex-B).
- 3. Under the RFP, the Technical Proposal Format and Content required from the participating firms/consultants require consultants to submit the following information in violation of SPPRA Rules 2010:
 - a. Bidders must provide average Annual Turnover for last 3 years (in million rupees) of Consultancy - 25 points (Attach Audit Reports & Financial Statement) (Annex-C).
- 4. This information is in violation of SPPRA SBD for Consultants dated 21-1-2012, as RFP Documents for Selection of Consultants do not require financial information from the consultants.
- 5. Additionally, SPPRA Rules 2010 require all procurements to be a part of the Annual Procurement Plans of the procuring agency which shall also be posted on SPPRA website, in July 2023. However, Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) Contract Management, Municipal Services Department, Annual Procurement Plan for 2023-2024 (Updated on 18.08.2023) does not contain procurements under the subject RFP of KMC i.e. Consultancy Services for Design and Construction Supervision of Roads, Bridges, Flyovers, Underpasses, Water Supply Lines, Sewerage System, Storm Water Drainage System, Buildings for various Projects in Karachi (Annex-D).



Transparency International Pakistan's Comments

Transparency International Pakistan has reviewed the allegations of the complaint, prima facie the allegations seem to be correct.

Following are TI Pakistan comments:

1. SPPRA Request for Proposals Documents for Selection of Consultants Date Sheet require the following from the consultants, quoted below (Annex-E)

Option A

Criteria, sub-criteria, and point system for the evaluation of Full Technical Proposals are:

- (i) Specific experience of the Consultants relevant to the assignment
- (ii) Adequacy of the proposed methodology and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference
- (iii) Key professional staff qualifications and competence for the assignment
- (iv) Suitability of the transfer of knowledge (training) program
- (v) Participation by nationals among proposed key staff

Option B

Criteria, sub-criteria, and point system for the evaluation of Simplified Technical Proposals are:

- (vi) Adequacy of the proposed methodology and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference
- (vii) Key professional staff qualifications and competence for the assignment
- It may be noted that for the consultancy work, there is no requirement regarding financials and annual turnover of the previous assignments undertaken by the consultants, therefore the requirement of average Annual Turnover for last 3 years in KMC RFP appears to be in violation of SPPRA Rules 2010.
- 3. As per SPPRA Rules 2010, Rule 11 Procurement Plan, procuring agencies are required to prepare an annual or a longer-term rolling plan for all proposed procurements, quoted below (Annex-F)
 - SPPRA Rule 11: Procurement Plan All procuring agencies shall devise a mechanism for planning in detail for all proposed procurements, determining the requirement of the procuring agency, within its available resources and prepare an annual or a longer-term rolling plan, detailing the procurement methods applicable for specific procurements.
- 4. If the allegations on the above violations are correct, the subject procurement may deemed to be declared as Mis-Procurement under SPPRA Rule No 32 (A) 1 (b), quoted below:
 - SPPRA Rule 32(A) 1(b): The Authority may take notice of any material violation of provisions of the Act, Rules, Regulations, Orders, Instructions or any other law relating to public procurement and declare the case to be of mis-procurement if such violation has been established.

Transparency International Pakistan Recommendations

Transparency International Pakistan requests the Mayor Karachi to review the allegations of the complaint in light of the SPPRA Rules 2010 and if found correct issue directives to the Engineering Department, KMC to amend RFP to ensure that the selection criteria outlined in subject RFP is in line



with the SPPRA requirements of selection of consultants, and ensure compliance with SPPRA Rules 2010, Rule 11, to avoid mis-procurement under Rule SPPRA Rules 2010, Rules 32(A) 1(b).

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for across the board application of Rule of Law, which is the only way to stop corruption, and achieve Zero tolerance against corruption.

With Regards,

(Advocate Daniyal Muzaffar)

Trustee/Legal Advisor

Transparency International Pakistan

Copies forwarded for the information with request to take action under their mandate to:

- 1. Caretaker CM, Govt of Sindh, CM House, Karachi
- 2. Chief Secretary, Government of Sindh, Karachi
- 3. Chairman, National Accountability Bureau (NAB), Islamabad
- 4. Director General, National Accountability Bureau (NAB), Karachi
- 5. Registrar, High Court of Sindh, Karachi

Note:

This is to clarify that Transparency International Pakistan is not a complainant, it acts as a whistleblower and operate under Article 19-A, of the Constitution of Pakistan which gives the right to public to know how government is being run by public officers. Article 19-A makes the right to access of information pertaining to a public authority a fundamental right, Justice Syed Mansoor Ali Shah in his landmark judgment in case of Ataullah Malik v. Federation of Pakistan includes following order.

Right to information is another corrective tool which allows public access to the working and decision making of the public authorities. It opens the working of public administration to public scrutiny. This necessitates transparent and structured exercise of discretion by the public functionaries. Article 19-A empowers the civil society of this country to seek information from public institutions and hold them answerable. PLD 2010 Lahore 605.

KARACHI METROPOLITAN CORPORATION ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT

neral (Technical Services) tropolitan Corporation

Behind Dawood Engineering Uni New M.A. Jinnah Road, Karachi. Phone No. 99230951

3/KMC/265/2023

Datec

REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL

Insultancy Services for Design and Construction Supervision of Roads, Bridges, Fl Juderpasses, Water Supply Lines, Sewerage System, Storm Water Drainage System Buildings for various Projects in Karachi

rachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) intends to hire/engage a Consultant (Engineering Organizatio ancy Services for Planning and Design and Construction Supervision of Roads, Bridges, Flyovers, I Vater Drainage System, Buildings etc. of various Projects and execute Umbrella Contract Agreement.

als are invited from reputable Consultant (Engineering Organization or Firm) having valid Pakistar (PEC) Registration Certificate in relevant field along with enlistment on Active Taxpayers List of Fed e and detail eligibility criteria provided in RFP Document.

cument can be downloaded from SPPRA Website or the same can be purchased from the office of Directly, Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) during working hours and working days on written requad accompanied a pay order amounting to Rs.5,000/- (non-refundable) in favour of Director Genera Metropolitan Corporation (KMC).

posal Meeting will be held on <u>24th August 2023</u> at <u>1400 hours</u> in the office of the Director Contract I at Old SBCA Building Ground Floor, behind Civic Center & adjacent to KW&SB main office Gulshan-e-k

ment will be carried out by adopting Single Stage Two Envelopes Procedure. The proposals completed in dance with instructions provided in RFP Document, in sealed envelope should reach on or before 30th hours in the office of Director General (Technical), Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) and be cancy Services for Planning and Design and Construction Supervision of Roads, Bridges, Flyovers, Vater Drainage System, Buildings etc. for various projects in Karachi.

ants are required to submit their proposal strictly in accordance with the Instructions to Consultants (ITC nd RFP Notice. Proposals must be prepared hard book binding form to deny the possibility of addition

al Proposal shall be opened on the same day at 1430 hrs, whereas the Financial Proposals of Technical be opened after Technical Evaluation. Other details are provided in RFP.

is providing unsubstantiated and / or incorrect information are liable to legal action and / or disqualification vertisement is also available on SPPRA Website.

curing Agency reserves the right to reject all the proposals as per SPPRA Rules.

/310/2023 3470/23 **Karac**

Director General (Technical Services) Karachi Metropolitan Corporation

سنڌ	وذندي	_		_	_		
	C		ø	۰	#	9	-

paper (06 Aug, 2023)



KARACHI METROPOLITAN CORPORATION ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT

Star Dist Acts.) English optivical Ci. U.C., 12023

Dated: 29 /8 2023

CORRIGENDUM

Subjecti -

NOTICE FOR EXTENSION OF DATE OF SUBMISSION OF REP

References

DESIGN & CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISION OF ROADS, BRIDGES, ELYOVERS, UNDERPASSES, WATER SUPPLY LINES, SEWERAGE SYSTEM, STORM WATER DRAINAGE SYSTEM, BUILDINGS FOR VARIOUS PROJECTS IN KARACHI

Due to some modifications in the RFP Documents the submission of the Proposals scheduled to be opened on 30-08-2023 has been extended to the next date 14-09-2023.

Modified RFP documents will be available in the office of the Director General (Technical Services), KMC during office hours.

This issue with the approval of Competent Authority, KMC

Selection Committee

Engineering Department, KMC

NOTICE BOARD

All Cartismating Consultancy Eirons

to to their

- 1. Director General (Technical Services), K.M.C.
- 2. All Committee Members,
- 3. Secretary to Mayor, KMC.

4. Office File.

	TOTAL TOTAL					
W	ill n	ot be considered for fur	rther	evaluation).		
C	riter	ia, sub-criteria, and po	int sy	/stem		
						<u>Points</u>
1 ((i)	Average Annual Turnov	ver fo	r last 3 years (in mil	lion rupees)	
		of Conultancy (Attach				[0 - 25]
		Rs. 700 and above -		25 Marks	,	
		Rs. 500 to 700		15 Marks		
		Rs. 300 to 500 -				
		Rs. 100 to 300 -				
		Less than 100		0 Marks		
(i	ii)	Specific experience of t	the Co	onsultants relevant to	the	[0 - 30]
		Design and Constructio				•
		Flyovers, Underpasses,		n Water Drainage Sy	stem and	
		Buildings in last five ye		<u> </u>		
		(Attach Completion Cer				
		Eight & more Projects -				
		Five Projects -				
		Three Projects -				
		Less than two projects-		0 number		
(i	ii)	Adequacy of the propo	sed n	nethodology and wo	rk plan in resp	onding to the
		Terms of Reference:				[0 - 15]
		a) Technical approach a	and M	lethodology	[0 - 5]	
		c) Work plan			[0 - 5]	
		d) Organization and stat	ffing		[0 - 5]	
(iv	/) K	ey professional staff qu	alific	ations and compete	nce:	[0-30]
		the assignment		-		
	a)	Principal Architect				[0-05]
		PCATP Valid Registr	ation	with		[0 00]
		Bachelor or Master D	egree	in relevant field		
		Masters Degree with	20 ye	ars Experience	5.0 points	
		Masters Degree with	15 ye	ars Experience	3.0 points	
1		Masters Degree with	10 yea	ars Experience	2.0 points	
		Less than 10 years exp	pereir	nce	0.0 point	
		OR				
		Batchelor Degree with			5.0 points	
		Batchelor Degree with			3.0 points	
		Batchelor Degree with			2.0 points	
		Less than 15 years exp	pereir	ice	0.0 point	
	b)	Principal Structural				[0-05]
		PEC Valid Registration				_
		Bachelor or Master De				
		Masters Degree with 2			5.0 points	
		Masters Degree with 1			3.0 points	
		Masters Degree with 1			2.0 points	
		Less than 10 years exp	perein	ice	0.0 point	
		OR				

KARACHI METROPOLITAN CORPORATION CONTRACT MANAGEMENT, MUNICIPAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT

Finanial Year 2023-24

					ent Plan (Upd	ated on 18.08	1.2023)					
		0	Esimolea	Estimated		Source of	Proposed	Firm	ing of Pr	DCU/6M6	ınts	
\$1	Description	Quantily (where Application)	Unit Cost (mere	fotal Cost	Funds Allocated	Funds (ADP / Non ADP)	Procurement Melhod	1st Citr	2nd Qtr	3rd Qtr	4th Qir	Remorks
1	7	3	4	5 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10	6	1		9	-10-	-11-		13
1	Operation & Maintenance with HR Services of 1339 citizen complaint information system for KMC (Head Office)		N/A	50.00 Million (Approximate)	Inticipated to be released	кмс	Single Stage Two Envelope	*				
2	Supply of 100 Nos, reusable Fusi- Face Respirators Masks (Carridge Tape) CW 400 Nos. Combatable 7- 100 Fifter Complying with International Standards EH136:1938 Class-1 & EN166-B for Fire Brigade Department, KMC	N/A	N/A	19.900 Mallon (Approximate)	Inticipated to be released	District ADP 2023 24	Single Stage One Envelope	4				
3	Provision of 04 Nos. Alabile Lighting Towers CAV Built-in Generators to Fire Bngade Department, KMC.		N/A	20.00 Million (Approximate)	Inticipated to be released	District ADP 2023 24	Single Stage One Envelope	4				
4	Supply of Al-Chohol Resistant AFFF Connectors for Karachi Fire Brigade Department, KMC.	IUA	NIA	20.00 Militon (Approximate)	Inticipated to be released	District ADP 2023 24	Single Stage One Envelope	4				
5	Provision of Fire Fighting Accessories for Fire Bingade Department, KIAC.	N/A	N/A	20 00 Atiikon (Approximate)	Inticipated to be released	District ADP 2023 24	Single Stage One Envelope	4				
6	Supply of Fire Hoses to Fire Brigade Department, KMC.	N/A	N/A	19.900 Maion (Approximate)	Inticipated to be released	District ADP 2023 24	Single Stage One Envelope	4				
	Provision of SCABA for Fire Fighting Operations in Karachi	N/A	N/A	20 00 Million (Approximate)	Inticipated to be released	District ADP 2023 24	Single Stage One Envelope	4				

CS CamScanner

KARACHI METROPOLITAN CORPORATION CONTRACT MANAGEMENT, MUNICIPAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT Finanial Year 2023-24

					ent Plan (Upd:	ated on 18.08.	2023)					
S #	Description	Quantity (may Applicable)	Estimated	Estimated	1	Source of	Proposed	liming of Procurements				
			[re-way	(renue	Cost	Total Cast	Funds Allocaled	Funds (ADP / Hon ACP)	Procurement Mathod	lst Oir	2nd Gir	3rd On
4.00	2	- 1		5		1	i i		171	are I (in)	_!7.	
8	Up-gradation of Hardware Infrastructure for Payroll, IT, KMC (Phase-I)		NIA	19 900 Million (Approximate)	intropated to be released	District ADP 2023 24	Single Slage One Envelope	4	9525			
9	Establishment of Disaster Recovery Site (Warm Computing Site) for IT, KMC (Phase-II)	N/A	N/A	19.900 fallion (Approximate)	Intiopated to be released	District ADP 2023 24	Single Stage One Envelope	٦				
10	Construction of Boundary Wall at Guishan-e-Zia Graveyard Orangi Town, District West, Municipat Services Department KMC		N/A	1,995 kt-lion (Approximate)	Inticipated to be released	KMC	Single Stage One Envelope	4				
11	Repair / Maintenance of Different Graveyard, Municipal Services, Department, KMC	N/A	NVA	.1.999 Million (Approximate)	Inticipated to be released	KNC	Single Stage One Envelope	1				
12	Construction / Improvement of Internal Road in Chakra Goth Graveyard Korangi No.06, District East, Municipat Services, Department, KMC		NVA	1,998 Million (Approximate)	Inticipated to be released	кмс	Single Stage One Envelope	,	b			

MUNICIPAL Services Department

Karichi Metropolitan Corporation

Director (CM)

Municipal Services Department, KMC



SPPRA REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS DOCUMENT SELECTION OF CONSULTANTS



Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority

21ST January 2012

	covered in the foregoing.
15.1	Amounts payable by the PA to the Consultant under the contract to be subject to local taxation, stamp duty and service charges, if applicable :
6.3	Consultants to state local cost in the national currency (in case of ICB only): YesNo
16.2	Consultant must submit the original and [Insert number] copies of the Technical Proposal, and the original of the Financial Proposal.
13.1	Choose only one of the below options:
	Option A
	Criteria, sub-criteria, and point system for the evaluation of Full Technical Proposals are:
	<u>Points</u>
,	(i) Specific experience of the Consultants relevant to the assignment: [0 - 10] Since all consultants have been shortlisted based on experience, ideally their experience should not be rated normally less than satisfactory, that is, not less than 70 percent.
1	(ii) Adequacy of the proposed methodology and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference:
	a) Technical approach and methodology b) Work plan c) Organization and staffing Total points for criterion (ii): [20 - 50]
	(iii) Key professional staff qualifications and competence for the assignment:
	a) Team Leader b) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] c) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] d) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] e) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] Total points for criterion (iii): [30 - 60]
	The number of points to be assigned to each of the above positions or disciplines shall be determined considering the following three sub criteria and relevant percentage weights:
	1) General qualifications [Insert weight between 20 and 30%] 2) Adequacy for the assignment [Insert weight between 50 and 60%] 3) Experience in region and language [Insert weight between 10 and 20%] Total weight: 100%
	(iv) Suitability of the transfer of knowledge (training) program: [Normally not to exceed 10 points. When transfer of knowledge is a particularly important component of the assignment, more than 10 points may be allocated; the

	following sub-criteria may be provided a) Relevance of training program b) Training approach and methodology c) Qualifications of experts and trainers Total points for criterion	[Insert points] .[Insert points] [Insert points] n (iv): [0 – 10]
	(v) Participation by nationals among proposed key staff (not to exceed 10 points)	[0-10]
	Total points for the five cr	iteria: 100
	The minimum technical score St required to pass is:1 number of points]	
	Option B	
	Criteria, sub criteria, and point system for the evaluation of Technical Proposals are:	f Simplified
1		<u>Points</u>
	(i) Adequacy of the proposed technical approach, methodology and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference ¹ :	[20 – 40]
	(ii) Key professional staff qualifications and competence for the assi	_
	a) Team Leader b) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] c) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] d) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] e) [Insert position or discipline as appropriate] Total points for criteric	[Insert points] [Insert points] [Insert points] [Insert points] [Insert points] on (ii): [60 - 80]
	The number of points to be assigned to each of the above position be determined considering the following three subcriteria and reweights:	ns or disciplines shall levant percentage
	2) Adequacy for the assignment [Insert weight be	etween 20 and 30%] etween 50 and 60%] etween 10 and 20%] veight: 100%
	Total points for the two co	riteria: 100
	When sub criteria are provided, which is always the case for proposed methodology and work plan" and "qualifications of key staff", for practical reasons the number of sub-criter to a minimum (typically no more than three for each criter Since sub criteria and their weighting determine the outcome valuation, they should be chosen considering the aspects the success of the assignment. Evaluation criteria and sub-criteria, associated points, and	and competence eria should be kept ion). me of the that are critical to the rating system
	form an arithmetic model to assess the technical merit of the	he proposals.

¹ Consideration may also be given to the number of pages submitted as compared to the number recommended under para. 3.4 (c) (ii) of these Instructions.

	All adopted sub-criteria should be specified in the RFP. The points allocated to each of the sub-criteria under "qualifications and competence of key staff" must be indicated in the RFP.
	The minimum technical score St required to pass is: Points [Insert number of points] Remuneration Type (Insert either 'Time Based' or 'Lump Sum'):
	The single currency for price conversions is:
20.1	Expected date and address for contract negotiations:
24.2	Successful consultant is required to submit performance security in form of pay order, demand draft or bank guarantee (PA shall insert amount but not more than 10% of the contract amount).
5.1	Consultant undertake to sign Integrity Pact for the procurement estimated to exceed Pak Rs.2.5 mllllon.

Sindh Public Procurement Rules 2010

Part II – PROCUREMENT OF GOODS, WORKS AND RELATED SERVICES

PROCUREMENT PLANNING

11. Procurement Plan

- (1) Mandatory Provision of Procurement Plan All procuring agencies shall devise a mechanism for planning in detail for all proposed procurements, determining the requirement of the procuring agency, within its available resources, and prepare an annual or a longer term rolling plan, detailing the procurement methods applicable for specific procurements;
- (2) Review and Update The procurement plan prepared for any project shall be reviewed and updated throughout the life of the project, such as estimates of time requirements, availability of funds, assumptions about institutional capacity, changing priorities and other factors that require plan adjustments for the success of the project. Such required adjustments will not invalidate the plan if made for improving the plan in the interests of the successful and timely completion of the project.

12. Limitation on Splitting or Regrouping of Proposed Procurement

- (1) Save as otherwise provided and subject to the regulations made by the Authority, a procuring agency shall prepare, in accordance with Rule 11 above, all proposed procurements for each financial year and shall proceed accordingly without any splitting or regrouping of the procurements already grouped, allocated and scheduled in the Procurement Plan;
- (2) The annual or longer rolling plan, as the case may be, thus prepared, will be posted in advance on the Authority's website as well as on website of the procuring agency, in case the procuring agency has its own website.

13. Specifications

- (1) Specifications shall allow the widest possible competition and shall not favour any single contractor or supplier nor put others at a disadvantage. Specifications shall be generic and shall not include references to brand names, model numbers, catalogue numbers or similar classifications. However, if the procuring agency is convinced that the use of a reference to a brand name or a catalogue number is essential to complete an otherwise incomplete specification, such use or reference shall be qualified with the words "or equivalent".
- (2) Procurement of used or reconditioned equipment, plant or machinery is not permissible in any case whatsoever.
- 14. Approval Mechanism All procuring agencies shall provide clear authorization and delegation of powers for different categories of procurement and shall only initiate procurements once approval of the competent authorities concerned has been accorded.