TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL - PAKISTAN

Plot 72-F/2, 1st Floor, 9th Street, Jami Commercial,
Phase VII, Defence Housing Authority, Karachi
Phone: +92-21-35390408, 35311898
Fax: +92-21-35390410
Email: ti.pakistan@transparency.org.pk
Website: www.transparency.org.pk

July 02, 2025

TL2025/0702/1A

The Secretary,
School Education & Literacy Department,
Government of Sindh,
Karachi.

Subject: Complaint Against Allegations of Violation of Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (SPRRA) Rules 2010 and Order of the High Court of Sindh by The Education Works Department, School Education Department in the Tender for Procurement of Furniture for Govt. Schools in Different Districts of Karachi Worth Billions

Dear Sir,

Transparency International Pakistan refers to its letter No. TP2025/0604/3A dated 4th June 2025 on the subject above, addressed to the office of the Chief Minister Sindh. The copy of the letter was also sent to your office **(Annex-A)**

On TI Pakistan letter, the CM Secretariat Karachi vide Letter No. SO(IV)/CMS/CMD/SCH.EDU/2024/58 dated 24th June 2025 sent a letter to your office with the following remarks from the Chief Minister Sindh, quoted below **(Annex-B)**

"Please get a report from Education department"

TI Pakistan requests Secretary School Education & Literacy Department to share copy of the report.

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for across-the-board application of Rule of Law, which is the only way to stop corruption, and achieve Zero tolerance against corruption.

Regards,

Advocate Daniyal Muzaffar,
Trustee/Legal Advisor
Transparency International Pakistan

Note:

This is to clarify that Transparency International Pakistan is not a complainant, it acts as a whistleblower and operate under Article 19-A, of the Constitution of Pakistan which gives the right to public to know how government is being run by public officers. Article 19-A makes the right to access of information pertaining to a public authority a fundamental right, and a three member bench in case of Mukhtar Ahmad Ali vs the Registrar, Supreme Court of Pakistan, Islamabad, headed by Chief Justice Qazi Faez Isa in the landmark judgment on 16 October 2023, in CP No. 3532/2023, has declared that

> "What previously may have been on a need-to-know basis Article 19A of the Constitution has transformed it to a right-to-know, and the Access to information is no longer a discretion granted through occasional benevolence, but is now a fundamental right available with every Pakistani which right may be invoked under Article 19A of the Constitution"

Annex-A

CHIEF MINISTER'S SECRETARIAT, SINDH
KARACHI
No. SO (IV)/CMS/CMD/SCH.EDU/2024/58
Karachi, dated: 24th June, 2025

C.M's. DIRECTIVE
MOST IMMEDIATE

To,

The Secretary,
School Education & Literacy Department,
Government of Sindh,
Karachi.

SUBJECT: **COMPLAINT AGAINST ALLEGATIONS OF VIOLATION OF SINDH PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATORY AUTHORITY (SPPRA) RULES 2010 AND ORDER OF THE HIGH COURT OFSINDH BY THE EDUCATION WORKS DEPARTMENT, SCHOOL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT IN THE TENDER FOR PROCUREMENT OF FURNITURE FOR GOVT. SCHOOLS IN DIFFERENT DISTRICTS OF KARACHI, WORTH BILLIONS.**

I am directed to enclose herewith a letter dated 4th June, 2025 alongwith its enclosures received from Advocate Daniyal Muzaffar, Trustee/ Legal Advisor, Transparency International Pakistan, on the subject noted above, bearing the Honourable Chief Minister's remarks **(in original)** as under:-

"Please get a report from Education department."
Sd/-
15.06.2025
CHIEF MINISTER, SINDH

02. It is requested to furnish a detailed report on the subject matter to this Secretariat at the earliest for the perusal of Honourable Chief Minister Sindh, please.

24/06/25
(SARMAD ALI SHAIKH)
SECTION OFFICER **(IV)**

Copy for information and necessary action:

1. PS to Principal Secretary to Chief Minister, Sindh, Karachi.
2. PS to Additional Secretary-I, Chief Minister's Secretariat, Sindh, Karachi
3. Advocate Daniyal Muzaffar, Trustee/ Legal Advisor, Transparency International Pakistan, Karachi.
4. Master file.

2698-2025 - Directive# 31947

Annex-B

TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL - PAKISTAN

Plot 72-F/2, 1st Floor, 9th Street, Jami Commercial
Phase VII, Defence Housing Authority, Karachi
Phone: +92-21-35390408, 35311898
Fax: +92-21-35390410
Email: ti.pakistan@transparency.org.pk
Website: www.transparency.org.pk

June 04, 2025

TIP2025/0604/3A

Mr. Syed Murad Ali Shah
Chief Minister, Sindh
CM House Karachi

Subject: Complaint Against Allegations of Violation of Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (SPRRA) Rules 2010 and order of the High Court of Sindh by the Education Works Department, School Education Department in the Tender for Procurement of Furniture for Govt Schools in Different Districts of Karachi, worth Billions

Dear Sir,

Transparency International Pakistan has received a complaint against allegations of violation of Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (SPRRA) Rules 2010 by the Education Works Department, School Education Department in the tender for procurement of Furniture for Govt Schools in Different Districts of Karachi worth Billions **(Annex-A)**.

The complainant has made the following allegations:

That,

1. The Office of the Superintending Engineer Education Works Circle-1 Karachi, School Education and Literacy Department invited a tender vide no SE/EWK/Circle-I/NIT/2024-25/1413 Dated 14/03/2025 for the procurement of furniture for government schools in districts Karachi Central, South, Keamari and West, Karachi Region **(Annex-B)**.
2. The tender specifications have been designed in a way to award contract to the pre-selected bidder and in violation of SPPRA Rules 2010. The procuring agency has required the angle iron desks of obsolete and harmful design with ¾ thick wood, whereas the bidding documents referred to the requirement of the usage of 1-inch-thick wood.
3. The PPRA has transitioned to the e-Pak Acquisition and Disposal Systems (EPADs), however, the School Education Department has failed to comply with the EPAD provisions and carried out procurement manually.
4. The furniture requirements, such as the usage of angle iron material, sharp edges and corners, are considered harmful for standard furniture, which is required in schools. However, to favor the pre-selected bidder, the requirements have changed as opposed to the ones used by the education department in the past such as round pipe.
5. Further, the top dimensions of the desk have reduced from 16 inches to 12 inches, which will affect students usability as well is in violation of the Sindh High Court order in SUIT NO: 919/2022 **(Annex-C)**.

Transparency International Pakistan's Comments

Transparency International Pakistan has reviewed the allegations of the complaint, prima facie, the allegations seem correct.

Following are TI Pakistan's comments:

SPPRA Rules 2010 require procuring agencies to draft unambiguous evaluation criteria which cannot change at any step of the procurement process. The difference in the specification regarding the width of the desk as well as Split/French polish and 'painting/marking' etc will mean the financial bid of participating bidders can be affected as the cost can increase. The failure to provide a clear and unambiguous evaluation criteria in the bidding documents amounts to mis-procurement, as quoted below:

> ***SPPRA Rule 21-A: Evaluation Criteria:*** *The Procuring agencies shall formulate as appropriate evaluation criterion, listing all the relevant information against which a*

bid is to be evaluated and criteria of such evaluation shall form an integral part of the biding documents. The failure to provide a clear and unambiguous evaluation criteria in the bidding documents shall amount to mis-procurement.

2. The Honorable High Court of Sindh has ordered in Suit No. 919/022 "that as per specifications top of those desks shall not be less than 16 inches", and the allegations that the dimensions has been reduced to facilitate chosen suppliers must be investigated.

Transparency International Pakistan's Recommendations

TI Pakistan requests the Chief Minister of Sindh to examine the allegations in light of the complaint in light of SPPRA Rules and if found correct, order to terminate the procurement process and re-invite tender in compliance with SPPRA Rules 2010 to avoid mis-procurement.

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for the across-the-board application of the rule of law, which is the only way to stop corruption and achieve zero tolerance against corruption.

Regards,

Advocate Daniyal Muzaffar,
Trustee/Legal Advisor
Transparency International Pakistan
Copies forwarded for action under the mandate to:

1. Chief Secretary, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
2. Secretary, School Education and Literacy Department, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
3. Registrar High Court Sindh, Karachi

Note:
This is to clarify that Transparency International Pakistan is not a complainant, it acts as a whistleblower and operates under Article 19-A of the Constitution of Pakistan which gives the right to the public to know how the government is being run by public officers. Article 19-A makes the right to access information pertaining to a public authority a fundamental right, and a three-member bench in the case of Mukhtar Ahmad Ali vs the Registrar, Supreme Court of Pakistan, Islamabad, headed by Chief Justice Qazi Faez Isa in the landmark judgment on 16 October 2023, in CP No. 3532/2023, has declared that;

"What previously may have been on a need-to-know basis Article 19A of the Constitution has transformed it to a right-to-know, and the Access to information is no longer a discretion granted through occasional benevolence, but is now a fundamental right available with every Pakistani which right may be invoked under Article 19A of the Constitution"