TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL - PAKISTAN

Plot 72-F/2, 1st Floor, 9th Street, Jami Commercial,
Phase VII, Defence Housing Authority, Karachi
Phone: +92-21-35311898, 35311777
Fax: +92-21-35390410
Email: ti.pakistan@transparency.org.pk
Website: www.transparency.org.pk

November 10, 2026

TL2026/1110/1A

Syed Murad Ali Shah
Chief Minister Sindh
CM House, Karachi

Subject: Complaint Against Allegations of Violations of Government Recruitment Rules and Conflict of Interest in the Appointment of Senior Leadership of the Public Sector Hospital (SICVD)

Dear Sir,

Transparency International Pakistan has received a complaint against allegations of violation of government recruitment rules and conflict of interest in the appointment of senior leadership of the public sector hospital (SICVD).

The complainant has made the following allegations:

1. The SICVD in violation of the recruitment rules has appointed a junior officer from National Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases (NICVD) as Chief Operating Officer (COO) without a publicly advertised recruitment process or an open and competitive selection procedure.
2. Following the retirement, the current Chief Operating Officer (COO) was appointed for a period of 2 years and on expiry of the term was granted a contractual extension for a period of another two years till February 20, 2028 **(Annex-B)**.
3. The Annual Audit Inspection Report on Accounts of NICVD for the financial year up to 2020 – 2021, Para 21 highlighted the irregular appointment of the same COO as Manager Medical Services (BPS-17) in NICVD back in 2018. The audit highlighted following violations **(Annex-C)**:
    a. Mr. Muhammad Moosa was appointed as Manager Medical Services (BPS-17) on 14.03.2018, however at the time of the appointment, Mr. Moosa's age was 51 years, and he had already crossed relation of upper age limited by 15 years by the GoS.
    b. It was observed that the requisite degrees were not available in his personal file and not produced by the concerned quarters.
4. The audit further highlighted that the recruitment was done without adherence to rules and indicate absence of internal controls and recommended recovery of Rs. 3.980 million **(Annex-D)**

Transparency International Pakistan Comments

Transparency International Pakistan has reviewed the allegations of the complaint, prima facie the allegations seem correct. Following are TI Pakistan comments:

1. The Sindh Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases (SICVD) is a major public-sector health hospital with an annual budget of more than Rs. 10 billion.
2. It is essential that the administrative and senior management appointments are conducted in accordance with the government recruitment rules and in line with the principles of transparency, merit and open competition.
3. The health department must also conduct inquiry into the findings of the DG Audit report 2020 – 2021 and determine if the observations have been complied with and responsibility fixed on relevant individuals as per the audit observation.

Transparency International Pakistan Recommendations

TI Pakistan requests the Chief Minister Sindh to investigate the serious allegations of the complaint and if found correct, issue directive to re-advertise the position through open competition and in accordance with applicable recruitment rules to uphold the merit and good governance.

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for across the board application of Rule of Law, which is the only way to stop corruption, and achieve against Zero tolerance against corruption.

Regards

Advocate Daniyal Muzaffar,
Trustee/Legal Advisor
Transparency International Pakistan

Copies forwarded for the information with request to take action under their mandate to:

1. Chief Secretary, Govt of Sindh, Karachi
2. Secretary, Health Department, Karachi
3. Registrar, High Court Sindh, Karachi

Note:

This is to clarify that Transparency International Pakistan is not a complainant, it acts as a whistleblower and operate under Article 19-A, of the Constitution of Pakistan which gives the right to public to know how government is being run by public officers. Article 19-A makes the right to access of information pertaining to a public authority a fundamental right, and a three-member bench in case of Mukhtar Ahmad Ali vs the Registrar, Supreme Court of Pakistan, Islamabad, headed by Chief Justice Qazi Faez Isa in the landmark judgment on 16 October 2023, in CP No. 3532/2023, has declared that

> "What previously may have been on a need-to-know basis Article 19A of the Constitution has transformed it to a right-to-know, and the Access to information is no longer a discretion granted through occasional benevolence, but is now a fundamental right available with every Pakistani which right may be invoked under Article 19A of the Constitution"

Annex-A

SINDH INSTITUTE OF CARDIOVASCULAR DISEASES
National Insurance Company Limited Building, 9th floor,
Abbasi Shaheed Road Karachi. 74400 – Phone: 021-99225881-9

OFFICE ORDER

In pursuance of the decision of the Governing Body of the Sindh Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases (SICVD) dated January 20, 2026, taken under Section 20 of the SICVD Act, 2018, it is hereby notified that the services of Dr. Muhammad Moosa as Chief Operating Officer (COO) shall continue on a contractual basis for a period of two (02) years, with effect from February 21, 2026 to February 20, 2028.

PROFESSOR JAWAID AKBAR SIAL
FCPS (Cardiology), FACC, FSCAI, FESC, FRCP
PROFESSOR OF CARDIOLOGY
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR – SICVD

Annex-B

OFFICE OF THE

DIRECTOR GENERAL AUDIT SINDH

1st Floor, Pakistan Audit & Accounts Complex, Gulshan-e-Iqbal, Block-11,
Main University Road, Karachi.
Ph: 021-99244751, Faxi 021-99244855

No DGAS/CS-II/AIR/09- 298 /2021-22/ 589 Dated: 4 / 3 / 2022

Executive Director,
National Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases,
Karachi.

Subject: **ANNUAL AUDIT INSPECTION REPORT ON THE ACCOUNTS MAINTAINED BY THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF CARDIOVASCULAR DISEASES, KARACHI FOR THE FINANCIAL YEAR(S) UPTO 2020-21.**

A copy of the Audit Inspection Report on the accounts of your office for the financial year upto 2020-21 is enclosed as Annex - A. The annotated reply to the report may please be furnished to this office within two weeks of receipt of this letter.

Receipt of this letter may please be acknowledged.

by Director

Enclosure: Annex - A

Copy to the Secretary, Health Department, Government of Sindh, Karachi along with Audit Inspection Report for information and necessary action.

-Sd-
Director

CS CamScanner

Para 22

CS CamScanner

Para 21 **Irregular appointment of Manager Medical Sciences (BPS-17) – Rs.3.980 million**

As per Government of Sindh, Services, General Administration and Co-ordination Department Notification vide No.SOII(S&GAD)5-64/2011, dated 26.02.2014 and further Notification No. SOII(S&GAD)5-64/2011, dated 27.07.2020, Government of Sindh has allowed relaxation upto maximum of fifteen (15) years in the upper age limit to all the applicants applying for the vacancies in all the Departments of Government of Sindh.

AND

According to Advertisement published in daily 'Dawn' dated 03RD April, 2017 regarding recruitment of Manager Medical Sciences (BPS-17) in NICVD, Karachi MBA / Masters degree with 8 to 10 years of experience in relevant field was required.

During annual audit of the office of Executive Director, National Institute of Cardiovascular Diseases, Karachi for the financial year 2020-21, while reviewing personal file of Mr. Muhammad Moosa, Manager Medical Sciences (BPS-17) it was observed that payment amounting to Rs. 3,980,508 /- made to him was found irregular and unauthorized on the following grounds:-

1) Mr. Muhammad Moosa was appointed as Manager Medical Sciences (BPS-17) on 14.03.2018. However, at the time of advertisement of the aforesaid post Mr. Muhammad Moosa's age was 51 years and he had already crossed the relaxation of maximum upper age limit of fifteen years (by eight years) allowed by the Government of Sindh under above quoted rule.

2) It was further observed that the requisite degrees of Postgraduate Diploma in Public Administration (PGDPA) & Masters were not available in his personal file. Moreover, above required degrees and record of verification of degrees from concerned quarters were not produced to audit.

CamScanner

The detail is as under;

Name of Officer	Designation / Grade	Salary per month (Rs.)	Per month salary x 12 months	Recovery Since July 2020 to June-2021 (Audit period) (Rs.)
Mr. Muhammad Moosa	Manager Medical Sciences (BPS-17)	331,709	331,709 x 12	3,980,508

Audit is of the view that appointment of above officer on the above said post without adherence of rules and regulations was found irregular which creates doubt about the appointment process. The lapse indicates improper watch and absence of the internal controls.

The matter was pointed out to the management but no reply was received.

Audit recommends that the above irregular appointment may be justified alongwith fixing the responsibility on the person at fault besides recovery of Rs.3.980 million under intimation to audit.

CamScanner