TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL - PAKISTAN

Plot 72-F/2, 1st Floor, 9th Street, Jami Commercial,
Phase VII, Defence Housing Authority, Karachi
Phone: +92-21-35311898, 35311777
Email: ti.pakistan@gmail.com
Website: www.transparency.org.pk

November 01, 2024

TL2024/1101/7A

Mr. Syed Murad Ali Shah
Chief Minister Sindh
CM House, Karachi

Subject: Transparency International Pakistan Recommendations on Uploading of Updated Information on the Website of Public Health Engineering & Rural Development Department, Govt of Sindh, Ensuring Citizens Access to Climate Data as per Article 19A of the Constitution of Pakistan, Sindh RTI Act 2016 and Supreme Court of Pakistan Judgement in CP No. 3532/2023

Dear Sir,

Transparency International Pakistan would like to draw your attention towards its recently released report titled "State of Data Disclosure of Climate Related Departments as per Access to Information Laws". The full report is available at: https://transparency.org.pk/PUBLICATION/State-of-Data-Disclosure-under-Access-to-Information-Laws-by-Climate-Related-Departments-in-Pakistan-October-2024.pdf. One of the departments included in this assessment is the Public Health Engineering & Rural Development, GoS, which has an overall poor average score of just 11%. **(Annex A & B)**

Climate related departments have a central role in climate action in Sindh. Access to updated information ensures effective implementation of climate strategies, stakeholders participation and a coordinated response. It builds trust among the local communities disproportionately affected by climate change, enhances transparency and encourages confidence among international institutions, necessary for an effective access to much needed climate finance.

The honorable Chief Minister is requested to issue directives for compliance with Sindh Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2016, section 6, Proactive Disclosure which mandates departments to proactively disclose information through their websites. It is also a mandatory obligation on public bodies under Article 19-A of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, as well as the honorable Supreme Court of Pakistan judgment dated 16 October 2023, in CP No. 3532/2023, which declared that; *"What previously may have been on a need-to-know basis Article 19A of the Constitution has transformed it to a right-to-know, and the Access to information is no longer a discretion granted through occasional benevolence, but is now a fundamental right available with every Pakistani which right may be invoked under Article 19A of the Constitution"*

Transparency International Pakistan remains available for any technical assistance department may require, implementing the recommendations. **TI Pakistan also requests meeting with the Secretary, Public Health Engineering & Rural Development Department to brief on the methodology of the report as well as discuss how these recommendations can be effectively implemented.**

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for across the board application of Rule of Law, which is the only way to eradicate corruption.

With Regards

Advocate Daniyal Muzaffar
Trustee/Legal Advisor
Transparency International Pakistan

Copies forwarded for the information with request to take action under their mandate to:

1. Chief Secretary, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
2. Secretary, Public Health Engineering & Rural Development Department, Karachi.
3. Chief Information Commissioner, Sindh Information Commission, Karachi.

ANNEX-A

THE STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF PROACTIVE DISCLOSURE BY CLIMATE RELATED DEPARTMENTS UNDER SINDH TRANSPARENCY AND RTI ACT, 2016

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	Avg.
(a)	1	0.5	0.75	0.75	0.75	0.75	0.5	0.5	0.75	0.75	0.5	0.25	0.65
(b)	0.5	0	0	0.25	0.5	0	0	0.75	0.5	0	0.5	0.5	0.29
(c)	0.25	0	0	0	0.25	0.25	0	0	0.25	0.25	0.25	0	0.13
(d)	0.5	0.25	1	0.75	0.75	0.5	0	0.75	1	0.5	0.75	1	0.65
(e)	0.5	0.5	0.75	0.75	0.75	0.25	0	0.5	0.75	0.25	0.5	0	0.46
(f)	0.5	0	0	0	0.5	0	0	0.25	0.75	0	0.25	0.25	0.21
(g)	0.25	0	0.5	0	0.5	0	0	0	0.25	0	0.25	0.75	0.21
(h)	0.25	0.25	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.25	0.25	0.75	0	0.25	0.5	0.25	0.35
(i)	1	0.25	1	1	1	1	0.5	1	0	0.5	0.5	0.75	0.71
(j)	0.5	0	NA	0	0.5	0	0	0	NA	0	0	0	0.10
(k)	NA	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.25	0	0	0	0	0
(l)	0.5	0.25	0.75	0.25	0.5	0.25	0.25	0.5	0.25	0.25	0	0.25	0.33
(m)	0.5	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.13
(o)	0.25	0	0	0	0.5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.06
Avg.	0.50	0.14	0.40	0.30	0.57	0.23	0.11	0.38	0.35	0.20	0.29	0.29	0.31

Lowest Score =0 Highest Score =1

1 DIRECTORATE OF CLIMATE CHANGE ECC&CD DEPARTMENT GOVERNMENT OF SINDH
2 ENERGY DEPARTMENT
3 FINANCE DEPARTMENT
4 FOREST DEPARTMENT
5 IRRIGATION DEPARTMENT
6 PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
7 PUBLIC HEALTH ENGINEERING & RURAL DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
8 Sindh Transport and Mass Transit Department
9 THAR COAL & ENERGY BOARD
10 Livestock and Fishries
11 Provincial Disaster Management Authority
12 Agriculture, Supply and Prices Department

7. Public Health Engineering and Rural Development Department

Clause	Website: https://phenrd.sindh.gov.pk/	Score
(a)	Particulars of its organization functions and duties	0.5
(b)	Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
(c)	Norms and criteria set by it for the discharge of its daily functions	0
(d)	Rules, regulations, notifications, circulars, instructions and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by it or being used by its employees in the discharge of its functions	0
(e)	Statement of categories of information that are under its control	0
(f)	Description of its decision-making processes	0
(g)	Details of all its administrative and developmental decisions	0
(h)	Directory of its officers and employees with their qualifications and respective remuneration, perks and privileges	0.25
(i)	Budget including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	0.5
(j)	Manner of execution of subsidy programs	0
(k)	Full particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorization granted by it	0
(l)	Facilities available with the public for obtaining information held by it	0.25
(m)	Complete particulars of its public information officer	0
(o)	Maintenance of record in respect of applications received and actions taken thereto	0
	Average	**0.11**