



June 10, 2025

TL2025/0610/1B

Mr. Sarfraz Bugti,  
Chief Minister Balochistan  
CM House, Quetta

**Subject: Complaint Against Allegations of Violation of Balochistan Public Procurement Rules 2014,  
by Deputy Conservator Of Forest, Quetta, Under Tender Number TSE-242505728733**

Dear Sir,

Transparency International Pakistan has received a complaint against allegations of violation of Balochistan Public Procurement Rules 2014, by Deputy Conservator of Forest, Quetta, Under Tender Number TSE-242505728733 (Annex-A).

The complainant has made the following allegations that;

1. The Deputy Conservator of Forest Quetta invited bids for execution of Water Resources Points, tender no. TSE-242505728733 for the year 2025 (Annex-B). The estimated cost of the tender is PKR 10,000,000.
2. The bidding documents issued by the procuring agency include eligibility criteria that is difficult and discriminatory as follow:
  - a. Mandatory Requirement No. 1 requires three assignments of similar size and complexity.
  - b. Mandatory Requirement No. 7 requires two assignments of similar nature and complexity worth PKR 30 million within the past three years, which is disproportionate to the estimated cost of the current tender, which is only PKR 10 million.

**Transparency International Pakistan Comments**

Transparency International Pakistan has reviewed the allegations of the complaint, prima facie, the allegations seem correct. Following are TI Pakistan comments:

1. The mandatory requirement of three assignments of similar size and complexity, along with the financial requirement of three times higher than the estimated cost of the award, can potentially exclude number of bidders and restrict competition, as quoted below:

*37. Discriminatory and difficult conditions. — Save as otherwise provided; no Procuring Agency shall introduce any condition which discriminates amongst bidders. In ascertaining the discriminatory nature of any condition reference shall be made to the ordinary practices of that trade, manufacturing, construction business or service to which that particular procurement is related.*

1. Any breach of the Balochistan Public Procurement Rules 2014 constitutes mis-procurement under Rule 57. The Rule is quoted below for your reference;

***57. Declaration of Mis-Procurement and consequences.(1)***

*(a) the Head of the Department on its own initiation or on recommendation of the Complaint Redressal Committee of the Department may declare the case to be of mis-procurement, if any material violation of the provisions of the Act , Rules, Regulations, orders, instructions or any other law relating to public procurement has been established;*



**Transparency International Pakistan Recommendations**

Transparency International Pakistan requests the Chief Minister to examine the allegations of the complaint in light of The Balochistan Public Procurement Rules, 2014, and if found correct, issue directives to terminate and re-invite the tender in compliance of the Balochistan Public Procurement Rules 2014, to avoid mis-procurement under BPPRA Rule 57.

Regards,

Advocate Daniyal Muzaffar,  
Trustee/Legal Advisor  
Transparency International Pakistan

Copies forwarded for the information with request to take action under their mandate to:

1. Chief Secretary, Government of Balochistan, Quetta.
2. Secretary, Forest and Wildlife Department, Government of Balochistan, Quetta.
3. Managing Director, Balochistan Public Procurement Regulatory Authority, Quetta.
4. Registrar, High Court of Balochistan, Quetta

**Note:**

This is to clarify that Transparency International Pakistan is not a complainant, it acts as a whistleblower and operate under Article 19-A, of the Constitution of Pakistan which gives the right to public to know how government is being run by public officers. Article 19-A makes the right to access of information pertaining to a public authority a fundamental right, and a three member bench in case of Mukhtar Ahmad Ali vs the Registrar, Supreme Court of Pakistan, Islamabad, headed by Chief Justice Qazi Faez Isa in the landmark judgment on 16 October 2023, in CP No. 3532/2023, has declared that

“What previously may have been on a need-to-know basis Article 19A of the Constitution has transformed it to a right-to-know, and the Access to information is no longer a discretion granted through occasional benevolence, but is now a fundamental right available with every Pakistani which right may be invoked under Article 19A of the Constitution”

## Annex-A

To,  
The Chairman,  
Complaint & Redressal Committee,  
Forest Department Quetta

Through: Chief Conservator (North) Forest Department Quetta

Subject: **COMPLAINT REGARDING UNLAWFUL TENDER REQUIREMENTS BY DEPUTY CONSERVATOR OF FOREST, QUETTA(TSE-242505728733)**

R/Sir,

It is respectfully submitted that the office of the Deputy Conservator of Forest, Quetta has published a tender for "Water Resources Points" under tender number TSE-242505728733, with an estimated cost of PKR 10,000,000/-.

However, the procuring agency has included conflicting and overly stringent conditions in the eligibility criteria under Mandatory Requirements No. 1 and No. 7 of the bidding documents, as under:

**Mandatory Requirement No. 1:**

"3 assignments of similar size and complexity."

**Mandatory Requirement No. 7:**

"2 assignments of similar nature and complexity worth PKR 30,000,000 in the past 3 years."

The above mentioned requirements appear to be contradictory and disproportionate, especially considering that the estimated cost of the tender itself is only PKR 10,000,000/- Requiring prior work experience amounting to PKR 30,000,000/- which is three times the estimated cost of the current project—creates an unreasonably high threshold that excludes many qualified bidders.

Such conditions seem to be in clear violation of Rules 34 and 37 of the Balochistan Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (BPPRA) Rules, 2014, which emphasize fairness, transparency, and the promotion of competition in the procurement process.

I kindly request to kindly take cognizance of this matter and ensure that the procurement process adheres to the applicable rules and regulations.

With best Regards,  
Fazal Brohi Govt Contractor



# Annex-B

Government Of Balochistan Deputy Conservator of Forest Quetta Department

TENDER NOTICE

TSE-242505728733

**Note: In All Procurements of GOB Whether Through Electronic or Manual Bid Submission, It is Mandatory For All Bidders to Get Registered At Electronic Public Procurement System of BPPRA GOB.**

The Deputy Conservator of Forest Quetta invites bids from Eligible Bidders for execution of following works for the Year 2025 based on Composite schedule rates 2023 on Percentage Rates

| S.No | Name of Work/s         | Estimated Cost | Tender Fee | Bid Security |
|------|------------------------|----------------|------------|--------------|
| 1    | WATER RESOURCES POINTS | 10,000,000     | 1,000 PKR  | 2%           |

1. Procurements shall be made under the Balochistan Public Procurement Rules – 2014.

**2. Eligibility of Bidders:**

- Presence in Active Tax Payer List
- The bidding firm must not be blacklisted by any procuring agency of Pakistan
- Balochistan Revenue Authority Registration is required
- The bidder must have completed 3 Assignment of similar nature of work
- Turn over of at least 7,000,000 PKR Amount in 2 subsequent previous years showing financial capacity of the firm
- 2 Assignments of Similar Nature and Complexity 30000000 in Previous 3 Years
- Audit report
- Fresh Bank Balance Statement
- Green Challan

3. **Procedure Of Procurement:** Single Stage One Envelope Bidding Procedure

4. **Bid Security:** The bids must accompany Bid Security in the form of **Bank Gurantee, Deposit at Call** of 2 % specified above in the name of the under-signed from a scheduled bank.

5. **Tender Documents:** The bidding documents can be obtained from the office of the under-signed **1,000 PKR**

6. **Issuance of tender Documents:** From the date of publication of NIT to **12 June, 2025** during office hours on working days

7. **Last Date of bid submission:** The Tenders must be submitted latest by **12 June, 2025** till **10:00 AM** .

8. **Tender opening:** All tenders will be opened on same day at the office of the under-signed at **11:00 AM**

9. **Address:** Quetta

**Phone no:** 0819202606 **Fax no:** 0819201139 **Email:** saleemjzehri@gmail.com



Divisional Forest Officer  
Deputy Conservator of Forest Quetta

Annex-B

INVITATION FOR BIDS

DATE:28 May, 2025

Loan / Credit No. :\_\_\_\_\_

BID REFERENCE#:TSE-242505728733

1. The Employer, **Deputy Conservator of Forest Quetta**, invites sealed bids from eligible firms or persons licensed by the Pakistan Engineering Council in the appropriate category and duly qualified with the Employer for the Works, **[enter title, type and financial volume of work]**, which will be completed in **[enter appropriate time period]** days.
2. A complete set of Bidding Documents may be purchased by an interested eligible bidder on submission of a written application to the office given below and upon payment of a non-refundable fee of Rupees **1,000.00 PKR**. Bidders may acquire the Bidding Documents from the Office of the Employer, at **[Mailing Address]** or can be downloaded from BPPRA site wide TSE No: .
3. All bids must be accompanied by a Bid Security in the amount of **2 % (of Estimate Cost)** and must be delivered to **[Indicate Address and Exact Location]** at or before **Invalid date**, on **11/06/2025**. Bids will be opened at **Invalid date** on the same day in the presence of bidders’ representatives who choose to attend, at the same address **[indicate the address if it differs]**.  
t;t;t;